Farms, Quads & Kids (2001-2014)

A/Prof Tony Lower

August 15, 2014

Sydney Medical School

A Lesson from the USA

“ATVs remain the most dangerous discretionary use product for children within CPSC’s jurisdiction. In the past three decades, at least 2,775 children under the age of sixteen have died in ATV-related accidents and at least 807,000 were treated in emergency rooms for injuries resulting from ATVs. Sadly, these numbers continue to grow.”

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>The Medical Literature</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>› Yet more pediatric injuries associated with all-terrain vehicles: Should kids be</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>using them?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>› Pediatric anthropometrics are inconsistent with current guidelines for assessing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>rider fit on all-terrain vehicles.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>› Dangerous toys.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>› Unsafe at any age: a retrospective review of all-terrain vehicle injuries in two</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>level I trauma centers from 1995 to 2003.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>› Still unsafe, still in use: Ongoing epidemic of all-terrain vehicle injury</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>hospitalizations among children.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>› All-terrain vehicle injuries in children: industry-regulated failure.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>› Unsafe at any speed - kids riding all-terrain vehicles.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>› All-terrain vehicle use by children: a form of child neglect?</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>A Brief History</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>› CPSC (1986) - ATV’s an “Imminently hazardous product”- one step short of a ban.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>› Legal agreement with major manufacturers (Consent Decree 1988)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- banned sales of 3-wheelers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- specific sized quads &gt;90cc developed for children</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>› Changes to youth or “child-appropriate” models based on speed (ANSI 2010)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- 6-9 years restricted 16km/h maximum 24km/h</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- 10-13 years restricted 24km/h maximum 48km/h</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- 14-15 years restricted 32 or 48 km/h maximum 61km/h</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Adults not restricted unlimited</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
All deaths data are retrieved from the National Coroners Information System (NCIS).

Covers period 2001- current (July 31)

In this period we have 192 deaths in our register.

Of these, 35 (18.2%) relate to children under 16 years of age

Farms were the location of death in 83% of cases (n=29).

Child Deaths on Quads 2001-2014

[Diagram showing the number of deaths by year and quads]
Role in Event - Children (n=35)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Age Group</th>
<th>Driver</th>
<th>Driver with Passenger</th>
<th>Passenger</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>0-5yrs</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6-10yrs</td>
<td>4</td>
<td></td>
<td>3</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11-15yrs</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TOTAL</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>35</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Child Deaths - Size of Quad

- Adult quads 86% (n=30)
- Child quads 14% (n=5)

- Of the five incidents involving allegedly “child-appropriate” quads:
  - all were wearing a helmet
  - four of the five were crushed/asphyxiated under the quad.

- “Quad bikes are more stable upside down than on their wheels” (Geoff McDonald - Forensic Engineer)
- “Quad bikes are prone to rollover” (Coroner John Olle, 2009)
What’s the Story in the USA?


› Ownership - Quads with engine size of <90cc represent 7% of total market (Levenson - US CPSC).

› Use - 3% of youth 10-15 years rode an appropriate sized quad (Campbell et al, 2010) - 1.8% of those under 12 rode a suitable sized quad (Hafner et al, 2012) - none of those aged 12-15 rode a suitable sized quad (Hafner et al, 2012)

› The high prevalence of fatal injuries to children using adult sized quads does not justify that “child-appropriate” quads are safe. The data simply reflect the pattern of exposure.

Evidence - Safety of “Child-Appropriate” Quads

› Risk of injury / driving hours for those under 16 is reduced by only 18% when driving a youth-model ATV with an engine size of <90 cc, compared with operating an adult-sized vehicle with an engine size >200 cc.

› The risk on a smaller vehicle is still almost twice that of an older driver on a larger machine.

› The risk of injury to a driver less than 16 years old operating a smaller machine is five times higher than the risk to an older driver on the same sized machine.

Defending the Indefensible

› “Honda and other manufacturers build children’s quad bikes and there’s no real issue with the safety of those machines.”


Victorian Data (2002/03-2010/11)

› There were: 19 fatalities, 766 admissions, 816 ED presentations.

› Children (0-14 years): 16% fatalities, 21% admissions, 32% ED presentations

› 29% of admissions classified as “serious threat to life” (ICISS <0.941)

› Quad incidents more likely to be serious than:
  - all other injuries (p<0.001)
  - all other injured motorcycle riders (p=0.001)
Control Access to the Key – if owners keep keys away from children, they will not be able to operate

“Child-Proof” Ignition Safety Locks – concerns over feasibility, effectiveness and potential hazards

The Too Hard Basket for FCAI Members

Timeline for Change: Child-Resistant Start Mechanism

› October 19, 2012 - Melbourne Quads Forum (Child issue raised)

› August 1, 2013 - first quads with child-resistant start mechanism on Australian market (10 months & 12 days after Forum)

› Jan 1, 2014 - members of Australian Quad Distributors Association (approx. 15% of Aust market) agree that all adult quads will come fitted standard with a child-resistant start mechanism by 1 January 2014.

› July 2014 - FCAI members fail to react & actively resist change
Summary - Adult Quads

› There is universal agreement that children under 16 years should not ride (or be carried as passengers) on adult sized quads.

› Farmers (and others) must urgently heed these recommendations & adopt practices that reflect this safety priority. There are NO EXCUSES to let kids ride (or be passengers) on adult quads.

› FCAI-aligned manufacturers continue to stymie safety improvements on adult machines to deter children (e.g. child resistant start mechanisms) and divert all responsibility for a faulty product to owners.

› A child-resistant start mechanism should be mandatory on all adult quads entering Australia.

Summary - “Child-Appropriate” Quads

› “With so little evidence that youth-sized vehicles significantly reduce injury risk, the Canadian Paediatric Society, along with many others, explicitly recommends that this minimum age restriction (16 years) apply to all ATV sizes and models.”

› Kids are “vulnerable users” & under Australian Consumer Law, products must be safe.

› The importation of “child-appropriate” quads should be banned in Australia by the ACCC until the industry can provide definitive evidence that their products are safe. This will stop new product entering the market.

› A buy-back scheme for the existing fleet of “child-appropriate” quads should be commenced and funded by the industry.
Kids & Quads - What Farmers Need To Do

» No children under 16 years to use a quad bike (of any size).

» Do not carry passengers of any age.

» Ensure kids can't access quads.

» Use alternate vehicles instead:
  - appropriately sized 2 wheelers (don’t crush/asphyxiate), utes, side-by-sides
  - maintain these alternate vehicles in good repair
  - training / supervision
  - developmentally appropriate tasks
  - wear a helmet / PPE on 2 wheelers, seat belts in utes & side-by-sides

No Precedents Wanted

» “We’re going to be monitoring your activities closely, with the hope that what you learn can help us back here in the United States.”

Kids and quads (of any size) are a fatal mix

No children under 16 years of age should ride quads of any size.

This is supported by:
- American Academy of Pediatrics
- American College of Surgeons
- American Pediatric Surgical Association
- Canadian Association of Pediatric Surgeons
- Canadian Medical Association
- Canadian Paediatric Society
- Royal Australasian College of Surgeons